



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
16th January 2024, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Sir Timothy John Le Cocq.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Vice-Admiral Jeremy Paul Kyd, C.B.E. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 9.44 a.m.)  
Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.36 a.m.)  
Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.56 a.m.)

---

Prayers

---

### **Standing Order 55A – remote participation**

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams. The following Members attended remotely, either for all or part of the meeting –

Connétable Philip Bond Le Sueur of Trinity  
Connétable Mark Anthony Labey of Grouville  
Connétable Kevin Charles Lewis of St. Saviour  
Deputy Rosemary Esther Binet of Grouville and St. Martin

### **Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Sanctions and Asset-Freezing (Implementation of External Sanctions) (Iran – R&O.119/2023.  
Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2023.  
*Minister for External Relations.*

Road Traffic (St. Brelade and Disabled Persons Parking – Amendments) (Jersey) Order R&O.121/2023.  
2023.  
*Minister for Infrastructure.*

Environment (2024 Miscellaneous Fees) (Jersey) Order 2023. R&O.122/2023.  
*Minister for the Environment.*

Marriage and Civil Partnerships (2024 Fees) (Jersey) Order 2023. R&O.123/2023.  
*Minister for Justice and Home Affairs.*

Infrastructure (Driver and Vehicle Standards – 2024 Fees) (Jersey) Order 2023. R&O.124/2023.  
*Minister for Infrastructure.*

Road Traffic (Public Parking Places) (Amendment No. 20) (Jersey) Order 2023. R&O.125/2023.  
*Minister for Infrastructure.*

### Documents presented

Draft Crime (Public Order) (Jersey) Law 202-. (P.97/2023): Children’s Rights Impact Assessment. P.97/2023.  
Add.  
Presented: 16th January 2024, *Minister for Justice and Home Affairs.*

Draft Crime (Public Order) (Jersey) Law 202-. (P.97/2023): comments. P.97/2023.  
Presented: 12th January 2024, *Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.* Com.

Requirement for Secunder at Time of Lodging a Proposition (P.102/2023) – Child Rights Impact Assessment. P.102/2023.  
Add.  
Lodged: 14th December 2023, *Deputy M.R. Ferey of St. Saviour*

Maximum Employment Probation Periods (P.103/2023) – Child Rights Impact Assessment. P.103/2023.  
Add.  
Lodged: 14th December 2023, *Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North*

Maximum Employment Probation Periods (P.103/2023): amendment. (P.103/2023 Amd): Child Rights Impact Assessment. P.103/2023.  
Amd.Add.  
Presented: 5th January 2024, *Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North.*

Maximum Employment Probation Periods (P.103/2023): comments. P.103/2023.  
Presented: 12th January 2024, *Minister for Social Security.* Com.

Remote participation within the States Assembly for the purpose of election of a Chief Minister or Minister (P.3/2024): Children’s rights impact assessment. P.3/2024.  
Add.  
Presented: 12th January 2024, *Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade.*

Remote participation to the States Assembly for the purpose of election of a Chief Minister or Minister (P.3/2024): comments. P.3/2024.  
Com.  
Presented: 16th January 2024, *Privileges and Procedures Committee.*

The Seaside Café site at Grève de Lecq - acquisition by the public and transfer to the National Trust for Jersey (P.5/2024): Children’s rights impact assessment. P.5/2024.  
Add.  
Presented: 15th January 2024, *Deputy L.J. Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter.*

Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202- (P.6/2024): Children’s Rights Impact Assessment. P.6/2024.  
Add.  
Presented: 16th January 2024, *Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

States of Jersey 2022 Annual Report and Accounts (R.73/2023) – comments. R.73/2023.  
Presented: 11th January 2024, *Public Accounts Committee.* Com.

Transfers between heads of expenditure under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019: Article 18 – 14th December 2023. R.179/2023.  
Presented: 15th December 2023, *Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

Transfers between heads of expenditure under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019: Article 18 – 14th December 2023. Presented: 15th December 2023, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.180/2023.
Living wage and minimum wage – investigation of statutory and other frameworks. Presented: 18th December 2023, <i>Minister for Social Security</i> .	R.181/2023.
Commissioner for Standards: Investigation of Complaint of Breach of the Code of Conduct for Elected Members by Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement and Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central. Presented: 21st December 2023, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	R.182/2023.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Minister for Health and Social Services – appointment of Assistant Minister. Presented: 3rd January 2024, <i>Minister for Health and Social Services</i> .	R.1/2024.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Chief Minister – Infrastructure portfolio and Assistant Minister appointments. Presented: 4th January 2024, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	R.2/2024.
Commissioner for Standards: investigation of complaint of breach of the code of practice for elected members by Deputy K.F. Morel of St. John, St. Lawrence, and Trinity. Presented: 4th January 2024, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	R.3/2024.
Government of Jersey Policy Framework for the Ports Sector. Presented: 9th January 2024, <i>Minister for Sustainable Economic Development</i> .	R.4/2024.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Minister for Social Security – delegation of powers to appoint officers to the Comptroller, Assistant Comptroller of Revenue (Technical) and the Manager – Operations in Revenue Jersey. Presented: 10th January 2024, <i>Minister for Social Security</i> .	R.5/2024.
Law Revision Board: summary of decisions – November 2023. Presented: 11th January 2024, <i>Law Revision Board</i> .	R.6/2024.
Children and Young People (Jersey) Law 202- Statutory Guidance. Presented: 12th January 2024, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	R.7/2024.
Children and Young People Safeguarding Arrangements. Presented: 12th January 2024, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	R.8/2024.
New Healthcare Facilities Programme Review – Interim Report (S.R.3/2023): Response of the Chief Minister on behalf of the New Healthcare Facilities Ministerial Group. Presented: 14th December 2023, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	S.R.3/2023. Res.
Bridging Liquid Waste Strategy 2023-2026 Scrutiny Review - Final Report Presented: 15th January 2024, <i>Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel</i> .	S.R.1/2024.

### Notification of lodged propositions

Maximum Employment Probation Periods (P.103/2023): amendment. Lodged: 5th January 2024, <i>Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North</i> .	P.103/2023. Amd.
---	---------------------

Draft Children and Civil Status (Amendments) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 21st December 2023, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	P.104/2023.
Draft Wills and Succession (Amendment No. 3 – Collateral Succession of Immovable Estate) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 22nd December 2023, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	P.105/2023.
Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister. Lodged: 2nd January 2024, <i>Deputy T.J.A. Binet of St. Saviour</i> .	P.1/2024.
Draft Children and Young People (Jersey) Commencement Act 202-. Lodged: 12th January 2024, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	P.2/2024.
Remote participation to the States Assembly for the purpose of election of a Chief Minister or Minister. Lodged: 12th January 2024, <i>Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade</i> .	P.3/2024.
Jersey Overseas Aid: re-appointment of a Commissioner. Lodged: 12th January 2024, <i>Minister for International Development</i> .	P.4/2024.
The Seaside Café site at Grève de Lecq - acquisition by the public and transfer to the National Trust for Jersey. Lodged: 15th January 2024, <i>Deputy L.J. Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter</i> .	P.5/2024.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 16th January 2024, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.6/2024.

### Written Questions

(see *Official Report/Hansard*)

- WQ.474/2023 1. The Chair of the States Employment Board had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding the number of staff made redundant in 2023.
- WQ.475/2023 2. The Minister for Social Security had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding the statutory minimum period of notice for employees.
- WQ.476/2023 3. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding Corporate Income Tax.
- WQ.477/2023 4. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade regarding revenue expenditure growth bids.
- WQ.478/2023 5. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade regarding ITIS (Income Tax Instalment Scheme) payments.
- WQ.479/2023 6. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade regarding facilities management.
- WQ.480/2023 7. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Martin regarding joint working with Guernsey on healthcare matters.

- WQ.481/2023 8. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier Central regarding the use of agency teaching staff from the UK.
- WQ.482/2023 9. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier Central regarding the Education Reform Programme.
- WQ.483/2023 10. The Minister for Social Security had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier Central regarding child maintenance payments from separated parents.
- WQ.484/2023 11. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding the provision of grants for the restoration of listed buildings.
- WQ.485/2023 12. The Minister for Sustainable Economic Development had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding alcohol duty rates.
- WQ.486/2023 13. The Minister for Sustainable Economic Development had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding capital bids submitted by Jersey Arts Centre.
- WQ.487/2023 14. The Minister for Social Security had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy L.V. Feltham of St. Helier Central regarding Child Personal Care Benefit.
- WQ.488/2023 15. The Minister for Social Security had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy L.V. Feltham of St. Helier Central regarding the Home Carer's Allowance.
- WQ.489/2023 16. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 11th December 2023 to a question asked by Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier South regarding the completion of the new Government building.

### **Oral Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- OQ.2/2024 1. Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the expenditure of public money on entering public service employees in the UK's Personnel Today Awards 2023.
- OQ.3/2024 2. Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding a resolution to the pay dispute with teachers.
- OQ.10/2024 3. Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier South asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the position of the Council of Ministers in respect of the introduction of a statutory living wage.
- OQ.4/2024 4. The Connétable of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for the Environment regarding the repair of roadside walls damaged during recent storms.
- OQ.6/2024 5. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier Central asked a question of the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs regarding the recording of deaths by suicide.

- OQ.8/2024** 6. Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding the eligibility requirements for Home Carer's Allowance.
- OQ.11/2024** 7. Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier South asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding recent reports that had indicate food-bank usage in Jersey had reached record levels.
- OQ.7/2024** 8. Deputy R.J. Ward of St Helier Central asked a question of the Assistant Chief Minister with responsibility for Digital regarding the existence of contractual arrangements between the Government of Jersey and Fujitsu.
- OQ.9/2024** 9. Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Sustainable Economic Development regarding the prospective formation of a consultative group for policy development in relation to the medicinal cannabis industry.
- OQ.5/2024** 10. The Connétable of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs regarding the prospective usage of electronic gates that employed facial recognition to process arrivals.

### **Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for the Environment answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for External Relations answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade that the Assembly should adjourn no later than 6.30 p.m. on that day.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 18**

Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson

#### **CONTRE: 28**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst

#### **ABSTAIN: 2**

Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy T.A. Coles  
Deputy H.M. Miles  
Deputy J. Renouf  
Deputy L.V. Feltham  
Deputy M.E. Millar  
Deputy A. Howell  
Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy B. Ward  
Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

### **Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister P.1/2024**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Thomas John Albert Binet of St. Saviour entitled 'Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister' (P.1/2024).

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, agreed the meeting that day would continue until consideration of the proposition of Deputy Thomas John Albert Binet of St. Saviour entitled 'Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister' (P.1/2024) had been completed, with a 10-minute adjournment to be taken at 5.30 p.m.

### **Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister P.1/2024**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Deputy Thomas John Albert Binet of St. Saviour entitled 'Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister' (P.1/2024).

### **Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired briefly from the Chamber during consideration of the proposition of Deputy Thomas John Albert Binet of St. Saviour entitled 'Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister' (P.1/2024) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mrs. Lisa-Marie Hart, Greffier of the States, until the Bailiff's return.

### **Roll call**

Following the 10-minute adjournment at 5.30 p.m., the Bailiff, in accordance with Standing Order 56(2), directed that elected members be summoned as the Assembly was inquorate. In accordance with Standing Order 56(2), having allowed such time as he considered reasonable for elected members to return to the Chamber, the Bailiff asked the Greffier to call the roll, as he believed that the States remained inquorate. The following members were present in the Chamber for this second roll call –

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy B. Ward

After the roll had been taken, the States remained inquorate and the Bailiff, in accordance with Standing Order 56(3), suspended the meeting for 5 minutes.

### **Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister P.1/2024**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Deputy Thomas John Albert Binet of St. Saviour entitled 'Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister' (P.1/2024) and, adopting the proposition, agreed that they had no confidence in the Chief Minister.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 27**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward

#### **CONTRE: 22**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**



**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 17th January 2024 to continue consideration of the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 7.44 p.m.

**W.J.C. MILLOW**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*